

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA  
CHARLESTON DIVISION**

**IN RE: ETHICON, INC.,  
PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM  
PRODUCTS LIABILITY  
LITIGATION**

**MDL No. 2327**

-----  
**THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO  
ETHICON WAVE 13 CASES**

**DEFENDANTS' NOTICE OF FILING JOINT VENUE RECOMMENDATIONS**

Defendants Ethicon, Inc., Ethicon LLC and Johnson & Johnson hereby give notice of filing  
Joint Venue Recommendations for Wave 13 MDL cases.

Dated: November 15, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ William M. Gage

William M. Gage (MS Bar #8691)  
Butler Snow LLP  
1020 Highland Colony Parkway  
Suite 1400 (39157)  
P.O. Box 6010  
Ridgeland, MS 39158-6010  
(601) 985-4561  
[william.gage@butlersnow.com](mailto:william.gage@butlersnow.com)

/s/ Susan M. Robinson

Susan M. Robinson (W. Va. Bar #5169)  
Thomas Combs & Spann PLLC  
300 Summers Street  
Suite 1380 (25301)  
P.O. Box 3824  
Charleston, WV 24338  
(304) 414-1800  
[srobinson@tcspllc.com](mailto:srobinson@tcspllc.com)

*Counsel for the Ethicon Defendants*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I certify that on this date I electronically filed this document with the clerk of the court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of this filing to CM/ECF participants registered to receive service in this MDL.

/s/ William M. Gage

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA  
CHARLESTON DIVISION**

**IN RE: ETHICON, INC.,  
PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM  
PRODUCTS LIABILITY  
LITIGATION**

**MDL No. 2327**

-----  
**THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO  
ETHICON WAVE 13 CASES**

| <b>AGREED</b>    |                                 |                    |   |
|------------------|---------------------------------|--------------------|---|
| <b>LAST NAME</b> | <b>FIRST NAME</b>               | <b>CASE NUMBER</b> | <b>RECOMMENDATION</b>   |
| Bowers           | Joanne Marion Skojec            | 2:19cv00164        | USDC for the Northern District of New York, Binghamton Division |
| Davidson         | Nancy Sue Barnes                | 2:15cv01436        | USDC for the Eastern District of Arkansas, Western Division     |
| Gonzalez         | Diana A.                        | 2:18cv01295        | USDC for the Northern District of California                    |
| Hall             | Phyllis Kay Wickizer            | 2:18cv01146        | USDC for the Northern District of Indiana, South Bend Division  |
| Harrington       | Jill Watkins Caparelli          | 2:19cv00299        | USDC for the Middle District of Florida, Tampa Division         |
| Larson           | Naomi Jean Maness               | 2:14cv22872        | USDC for the District of Minnesota, Minneapolis Division        |
| Parks            | Donna Gale Raulston             | 2:14cv10221        | USDC for the Southern District of California                    |
| Pizzitola        | Tammy Ruth                      | 2:13cv00249        | USDC for the Southern District of Texas, Houston Division       |
| Rocha            | Alize Adriana Chana Ortiz-Reyes | 2:14cv14097        | USDC for the Central District of California, Western Division   |
| Sobie            | Pamela K. Bee Patuszynski       | 2:12cv04789        | USDC for the Northern District of Illinois, Eastern Division    |
| Sutton           | Cassandra A. McPherson Compion  | 2:13cv16175        | USDC for the Eastern District Missouri, St. Louis Division      |
| Westerfield      | Debra Louise Lewis              | 2:14cv09748        | USDC for the Central District of California, Western Division   |

|         |                                 |             |   |
|---------|---------------------------------|-------------|---|
| Cobos   | Esperanza Buitron               | 2:17cv01986 | USDC for the Southern District of Texas,<br>Brownsville Division  |
| Dempsey | Stacey Lynn<br>Crittendon Beach | 2:17cv01987 | USDC for the Western District of Kentucky,<br>Louisville Division |
| Macknis | Rita A.                         | 2:16cv10467 | USDC for the Eastern District of Pennsylvania                     |
| Snyder  | Deborah S.                      | 2:16cv04193 | USDC for the Western District of Kentucky,<br>Louisville Division |

| DISPUTED  |                           |             |   |   |
|-----------|---------------------------|-------------|---|---|
| LAST NAME | FIRST NAME                | CASE NUMBER | DEFENSE RECOMMENDATION  | PLAINTIFF RECOMMENDATION  |
| Batson    | Deborah G.<br>Piatt       | 2:14cv06455 | USDC for the Middle District<br>of Florida, Fort Myers Division   | USDC for the Southern<br>District of Florida, West<br>Palm Beach Division<br>(where implantation<br>occurred) |
| Renteria  | Marie                     | 2:18cv01550 | USDC for the Southern<br>District of California   | USDC for the Central<br>District of California  |
| Risley    | Debra K.<br>Vancura Burns | 2:13cv05338 | Ethicon Defendants: USDC<br>for the Northern District of<br>Indiana, South Bend Division;<br><br>Boston Scientific Defendant:<br>USDC for the Eastern District<br>of California | USDC for the Eastern<br>District of Pennsylvania  |
| Turner    | Christie                  | 2:18cv01551 | USDC for the Northern<br>District of Alabama, Eastern<br>Division   | USDC for the Middle<br>District of Alabama  |

| UNRESOLVED |  |             |  |  |
|------------|--|-------------|--|--|
| LAST NAME  | FIRST NAME   | CASE NUMBER | DEFENSE RECOMMENDATION   | PLAINTIFFS' LIAISON STATEMENT  |
| Lim        | Deserie<br>Michelle<br>Baker<br>Chaney<br>Franklin | 2:13cv06974 | USDC for the Southern<br>District of Mississippi,<br>Northern Division | Leadership has been<br>unable to verify<br>agreement nor proposed<br>venue and does not<br>represent that this venue<br>is correct or not for this<br>Plaintiff. |
| Torres     | Eda  | 2:16cv01835 | USDC for the Southern<br>District of Florida, Miami<br>Division        | Leadership has been<br>unable to verify<br>agreement nor proposed<br>venue and does not<br>represent that this venue   |

|          |                          |             |   |  |
|----------|--------------------------|-------------|---|--|
|          |                          |             |   | is correct or not for this Plaintiff.  |
| Furtado  | Sylvia Irene Howarth     | 2:15cv12667 | USDC for Massachusetts, Boston Division                             | Leadership has been unable to verify agreement nor proposed venue and does not represent that this venue is correct or not for this Plaintiff. |
| Watts    | Kathryn Louise Henderson | 2:16cv06001 | USDC for the Western District of KY                                 | Leadership has been unable to verify agreement nor proposed venue and does not represent that this venue is correct or not for this Plaintiff. |
| Brown    | Katrina                  | 2:16cv08237 | USDC for the Southern District of Ohio, Columbus Division           | Leadership has been unable to verify agreement nor proposed venue and does not represent that this venue is correct or not for this Plaintiff. |
| Copeland | Ramona                   | 2:17cv00846 | United States District Court for the Southern District of Indiana   | Leadership has been unable to verify agreement nor proposed venue and does not represent that this venue is correct or not for this Plaintiff. |
| Wood     | Lena F.                  | 2:13cv12166 | Boston Scientific Defendant: USDC for the Eastern District of Texas | Leadership has been unable to verify agreement nor proposed venue and does not represent that this venue is correct or not for this Plaintiff. |
| Holm     | Julie Ann                | 2:15cv07038 | USDC for the District of Minnesota, St. Paul Division               | Leadership has been unable to verify agreement nor proposed venue and does not represent that this venue is correct or not for this Plaintiff. |